

**Butler County Board of Elections
Board Meeting Minutes
September 11, 2023**

The Butler County Board of Elections met on Monday, September 11, 2023, at 9:00 a.m. for a regular meeting. Roll call was taken and present were Chairman Frank Cloud, Member mariann penska, Member Todd Hall, Member Chris Wunnenberg III, Director Nicole Unzicker, Deputy Director Eric Corbin, Early Voting Administrator Stephanie Webb, Ohio Democratic Party Representative, Kevin O’Neil, Members of the Public Graeme George, Charis Peterson, Gerry Dzikowski, Gail Niederlehner, Terry Cunningham, Marsha Whitt, Kevin Whitt, Audrey Dunaway, and Poll Worker Administrator/Executive Assistant Melissa Trotta.

Chairman Cloud presented Document 1, Bills. Member Hall moved to approve the bills on Document 1; seconded by Member penska. Chairman Cloud asked if there were any comments or questions. Member Hall inquired about the Dominion Voting System in the amount of \$4,500.00. Deputy Director Corbin stated the expense is for election day support from Dominion, the voting system vendor for the August 8, 2023 Special Election. Deputy Director Corbin explained a representative from Dominion Voting Systems is onsite to assist with any issues. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud	yea
Member penska	yea
Member Hall	yea
Member Wunnenberg	yea

All in favor; motion carried.



Regular Board Meeting Bills
Butler County Board of Elections

[Signature]
Chairman

[Signature]
Director

Grand Total \$ 126,282.68

Account / Vendor / Description	Amount
521000 - POSTAGE	
UNITED STATES POSTAL	
PERMIT 4667 POSTAGE SUPPLIES	\$10,000.00
UNITED STATES POSTAL Total	\$10,000.00
521000 - POSTAGE Total	\$10,000.00
524000 - GAS/FUEL/OIL	
VOYAGER FLEET SYSTEM	
JULY FUEL SUPPLIES	\$131.54
VOYAGER FLEET SYSTEM Total	\$131.54
524000 - GAS/FUEL/OIL Total	\$131.54
525100 - SOFTWARE/HARDWARE EQUIP	
JAY A KLEIN	
HARD DRIVE	\$129.35
JAY A KLEIN Total	\$129.35
525100 - SOFTWARE/HARDWARE EQUIP Total	\$129.35
529000 - OTHER MATERIALS/SUPPLIES	
4IMPRINT INC	
PEO APPRECIATION SUPPLIES	\$2,720.78
4IMPRINT INC Total	\$2,720.78
AMAZON CAPITAL SERVI	
ELECTION SUPPLIES	\$1,943.44
AMAZON CAPITAL SERVI Total	\$1,943.44
JOS BERNING PRINTING	
ELECTION SUPPLIES	\$2,405.00
JOS BERNING PRINTING Total	\$2,405.00
KIM ELLENBURG	
PEO APPRECIATION SUPPLIES	\$80.00
KIM ELLENBURG Total	\$80.00
MELISSA TROTTA	
PEO APPRECIATION SUPPLIES	\$153.31
MELISSA TROTTA Total	\$153.31
MENARDS	

Bills

Account / Vendor / Description	Amount
ELECTION SUPPLIES	\$199.01
MENARDS Total	\$199.01
NICOLE UNZICKER	
ELECTION MEAL	\$21.98
NICOLE UNZICKER Total	\$21.98
ODP BUSINESS SOLUTIO	
ELECTION SUPPLIES	\$1,808.16
PRECINCT ABSENTEE LIST 8.8.2023	\$1,730.10
ODP BUSINESS SOLUTIO Total	\$3,538.26
ONLINE LABELS LLC	
ELECTION LABELS	\$63.21
ONLINE LABELS LLC Total	\$63.21
PRO SOURCE PAPER	
ICX PAPER SUPPLIES	\$17,435.00
PRO SOURCE PAPER Total	\$17,435.00
ULINE INC	
CART SUPPLIES FOR EV	\$693.48
ULINE INC Total	\$693.48
US BANK	
ELECTION MEAL	\$1,047.82
ELECTION / PEO APPRECIATION MEAL	\$1,786.86
US BANK Total	\$2,834.68
529000 - OTHER MATERIALS/SUPPLIES Total	\$32,088.15
530000 - EQUIP/BLDG MAIN & REPAIR SVC	
PETER PAUL OFFICE EQ	
CLEAN/TESTS 9 BALLOT PRINTERS	\$834.90
PETER PAUL OFFICE EQ Total	\$834.90
530000 - EQUIP/BLDG MAIN & REPAIR SVC Total	\$834.90
530075 - TECHNOLOGY SUPPORT	
DOMINION VOTING SYST	
ELECTION DAY SUPPORT 8.8.23	\$4,500.00
DOMINION VOTING SYST Total	\$4,500.00
ESSVR LLC	
JULY 2023 VOTER FILE MAINTENANCE	\$7,749.19
ESSVR LLC Total	\$7,749.19
FOR THE RECORD	
FTR ANNUAL SUPPORT	\$795.00
FOR THE RECORD Total	\$795.00
VERIZON WIRELESS	
AUG WIRELESS SUPPORT	\$1,734.22
VERIZON WIRELESS Total	\$1,734.22
530075 - TECHNOLOGY SUPPORT Total	\$14,778.41
530500 - TRAVEL & TRAIN EXPENSE	
ERIC A CORBIN	

Bills

Account / Vendor / Description	Amount
MEALS CLE SEMINAR 7.26.23	\$83.20
ERIC A CORBIN Total	\$83.20
NICOLE UNZICKER	
MEALS CLE SEMINAR 7.26.23	\$83.20
NICOLE UNZICKER Total	\$83.20
SPIRIT SEMINARS AND	
"MANAGING TEAM CONFLICT" SEMINAR 8.2.23	\$396.00
SPIRIT SEMINARS AND Total	\$396.00
US BANK	
HOTEL CONFERENCE 6.26.23-6.27.23	\$695.82
HOTEL CLE SEMINAR 7.26.23	\$349.30
US BANK Total	\$1,045.12
530500 - TRAVEL & TRAIN EXPENSE Total	\$1,607.52

536000 - OTHER CONTRACT SVCS

DOLCE VITA PHOTOGRAP	
HEAD SHOT FOR NEW EMPLOYEE 7.3.23	\$50.00
DOLCE VITA PHOTOGRAP Total	\$50.00
FEDEX	
JULY SHIPPING	\$59.01
JUL Y SHIPPING	\$63.57
FEDEX Total	\$122.58
GRAPHIC VILLAGE LLC	
29,000 SUPPLEMENTAL PRINTED AND MAILED	\$13,402.00
BALLOTS PRINTED AND MAILED 8.8.23	\$14,999.48
GRAPHIC VILLAGE LLC Total	\$28,401.48
HAMILTON CITY SCHOOL	
CUSTODIAL FEES 8.8.23	\$1,072.50
HAMILTON CITY SCHOOL Total	\$1,072.50
MIAMI UNIVERSITY	
CUSTODIAL FEES 8.8.23	\$300.00
RENTAL FEES 8.8.23	\$897.50
MIAMI UNIVERSITY Total	\$1,197.50
MILLENNIUM BUSINESS	
AMIL-5138873700.FLEX COPIES.7	\$606.97
MILLENNIUM BUSINESS Total	\$606.97
REACH MAGAZINE	
REACH AD TO RECRUIT PEO FOR 11.7.23	\$887.78
REACH MAGAZINE Total	\$887.78
TRACKMAIL SOLUTIONS	
BALLOT TRACKING SERVICE 8.8.23	\$10,950.00
TRACKMAIL SOLUTIONS Total	\$10,950.00
HAMILTON CHRISTIAN CHURCH	
RENTAL FEES 8.8.23	\$250.00
HAMILTON CHRISTIAN CHURCH Total	\$250.00
MIDDLETOWN CITY SCHOOL	
CUSTODIAL FEES 8.8.23	\$720.00

Bills

Account / Vendor / Description	Amount
MIDDLETOWN CITY SCHOOL Total	\$720.00
NORTH FAIRFIELD BAPTIST	
RENTAL FEES 8.8.23	\$300.00
NORTH FAIRFIELD BAPTIST Total	\$300.00
POASTTOWN FIRST CHURCH	
RENTAL FEES 8.8.23	\$200.00
POASTTOWN FIRST CHURCH Total	\$200.00
SECURITY LOCK COMPANY	
REPAIR OF LOCKS 8.9.23	\$129.00
SECURITY LOCK COMPANY Total	\$129.00
UNIVERSITY MOVING	
PICK DELIVERY OF VOTING EQUIPMENT 8.8.23	\$21,825.00
UNIVERSITY MOVING Total	\$21,825.00
536000 - OTHER CONTRACT SVCS Total	\$66,712.81
Grand Total	\$126,282.68

Chairman Cloud presented Document 2, minutes of the July 10, 2023, meeting. Member penska moved to approve July 10, 2023, meeting minutes on Document 2; seconded by Member Wunnenberg. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud	yea
Member penska	yea
Member Hall	abstain
Member Wunnenberg	yea

All in favor; motion carried.

Chairman Cloud presented Document 3, minutes of the August 8, 2023, meeting. Member Hall moved to approve August 8, 2023, meeting minutes on Document 3; seconded by Member penska. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud	yea
Member penska	yea
Member Hall	yea
Member Wunnenberg	yea

All in favor; motion carried.

Chairman Cloud presented Document 4, minutes of the August 16, 2023, meeting. Member penska moved to approve August 16, 2023, meeting minutes on Document 4; seconded by Member Hall. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud	abstain
Member penska	yea
Member Hall	yea
Member Wunnenberg	yea

All in favor; motion carried.

Director Unzicker acknowledged receipt of the following directives:

2023-16	Elections Security Ballots, Voting Schedule, and Deadlines for the November 7, 2023 General Election
2023-17	

Director Unzicker acknowledged receipt of the following advisory:

2023-03	Acquiring Electronic Pollbooks with State Funding
---------	---

Director Unzicker stated there are no memorandums.

Under New Business, Deputy Director Corbin presented Document 5, Certification of the August 8, 2023, Post-Election Audit. Deputy Director Corbin gave a brief explanation of the Post-Election Audit Workbook. Deputy Director Corbin stated the audit was 100 percent accurate. Member penska moved to approve the Post-Election Audit results for the August 8, 2023, Special Election as listed in Document 5; seconded by Member Wunnenberg. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud	yea
Member penska	yea
Member Hall	yea
Member Wunnenberg	yea

All in favor; motion carried.

Deputy Director Corbin presented Document 6, Precinct Elections Officials to be appointed to the 2023 – 2024 term per R.C. 3501.22 (A). Member Hall moved to appoint the Precinct Election Officials as listed on Document 6; seconded by Member penska. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud	yea
Member penska	yea
Member Hall	yea
Member Wunnenberg	yea

All in favor; motion carried

Director Unzicker presented Document 7, Candidates to be Certified to the March 19, 2024, Primary Election. Director Unzicker stated the candidates have met the statutory requirements

to appear on the ballot. Member Hall moved to certify the candidates as listed on Document 7; seconded by Member penska. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud yea
Member penska yea
Member Hall yea
Member Wunnenberg yea
All in favor; motion carried.



March 19, 2024 Primary Election
Board Certification

Candidate

The following candidate has met the statutory requirements.

Certified My 9-11-23
Admin. Sign & Date

Judge of the Court of Common Pleas (Full term commencing 1/2/2025)

- Kelly Heile - Republican

Director Unzicker presented Document 8, 2024 General Fund Budget Submission for review and approval. Deputy Director Corbin said the format is the same as in the past and meets the County Commissioners' guidelines. There was a discussion about capital improvements, security, technical support, election workers, and other contract services. Member Hall commended on how Director Unzicker and Deputy Director Corbin prepared the budget and how it was presented to the Board Members. Member penska moved to approve the 2024 General Fund Budget Submission as discussed in Document 8, seconded by Member Wunnenberg. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud yea
Member penska yea

Member Hall yea
Member Wunnenberg yea
All in favor; motion carried.

Deputy Director Corbin presented Document 9, Vacation Carry Over Exception. Deputy Director Corbin suggested a vacation carry-over exception for employees that were unable to take their vacation due to the August 8, 2023, Special Election and other projects. He explained that Ohio Revised Code 325.19 (c) allows an employee to carry over vacation time for three years under special circumstances. Deputy Director Corbin stated that in the county and board policies, you are only allowed to carry up to two years of earned vacation time. He said the employees will lose their vacation time on the anniversary of their hire date. Member penska moved to approve the Vacation Carry Over Exception as listed in Document 9, seconded by Member Hall.

Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud yea
Member penska yea
Member Hall yea
Member Wunnenberg yea
All in favor; motion carried.

Deputy Director Corbin presented Document 10, Updated Board Meeting Schedule. Deputy Director Corbin stated the meetings shaded in grey have been updated. He said the election day meeting will open on Monday, November 6, 2023 at 1:00pm. In addition, the November 22, 2023, meeting will only be held if there are voter intent ballots to review from the provisional ballots. Member Hall moved to approve the Updated Board Meeting Schedule as listed in Document 10, seconded by Member penska. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud yea
Member penska yea
Member Hall yea
Member Wunnenberg yea
All in favor; motion carried.

Under Old Business, Director Unzicker presented Document 11, Public Terminal for Signature Policy. Director Unzicker stated public signature verification was provided in previous years up to early 2020. She explained a security directive set forth by the Ohio Secretary of State (SOS) was received, and the public terminal was removed until further security measures could be taken. Director Unzicker stated Deputy Director Corbin, and herself had spoken with the Ohio Secretary of State's Chief Information Security Officer, Butler County Information Services department (BCIS), and the Board of Elections Database Administrators to produce a secure tool to provide candidates with a way to verify signatures before they file their petitions. Member Wunnenberg asked for details of the plan. Director Unzicker explained that the Cybersecurity Regional Liaison and BCIS compiled a way to disable Windows commands to comply with the SOS security directive. She stated, with the new configurations, the service could still be provided to candidates. Director Unzicker stated candidates would only be allowed to see the voter's signature, address, and party affiliation for verification. She said the terminal would be behind secure doors, the public would not have access to the laptop and would only have access to a monitor, mouse and keyboard. Only one staff member would maintain the multi-factor tokens and password. The security directive prohibits a staff member from sharing passwords and credentials with other staff members. Director Unzicker explained if the staff member is unavailable, the candidate would have to return when the staff member is available.

Member Hall clarified that up to 2020, candidates were allowed to come in to verify if the elector was registered and if they felt the voter's signature matched the voter registration database. Deputy Director Corbin stated yes. He explained the security directive was issued in July of 2019 and that all Board of Elections had until January 31, 2020, to implement the aspects of the directive. At that time, the public terminal was removed due to not knowing the procedures to secure the terminal. Deputy Director Corbin stated that the previous terminal was a virtual desktop computer run from servers, which is more challenging to secure for public use. He said the laptop was repurposed with additional controls for candidates and public users.

Chairman Cloud stated there had not been any issues in the past four years with not having a public terminal for signature verification. He said he realizes the Board of Elections is here to serve the public, but he still has security concerns, and a staff member must be available. Member Hall asked Chairman Cloud what his concerns were. Chairman Cloud said a directive was set forth that the boards must protect the voter registration database. Member Hall asked if the laptop will no longer be on the server. Deputy Director Corbin explained that the laptop is not running off the server like the virtual desktop computer was in the past, but it is still accessing the live voter registration database. Chairman Cloud motioned not to provide the public terminal; seconded by Member penska.

Chairman Cloud asked if there were further discussions. Member Wunnenberg stated the top priority is the integrity and security of the election. He stated, if it was possible to provide a secured terminal for candidates to verify their petitions, then it should be offered. He said if we could provide the public access terminal but didn't, he feels that the board is not providing the best service to the voters of Butler County. Member penska pointed out other counties that offer the service have a different voter registration database vendor. Member penska stated her opinion that the amount of candidates who would come in to verify signatures is minimal, the cost of having an employee available, resources having multi-factor tokens, and the risk of the employees sitting with candidates or members of the public outweighs the value to the candidates. She feels there will be expectations from candidates where they expect the staff member to assist in or comment on the validity of the signatures and petitions. Member Wunnenberg explained a staff member would not be sitting with the candidate. Director Unzicker stated that the staff member would log into the laptop behind secured doors. Deputy Director Corbin explained that there will be occasions when the staff member will need to train the candidate and members of the public on how to use the terminal before leaving the candidate to verify on their own. Director Unzicker stated all staff members must sign an acknowledgment stating they understand staff members are prohibited by law from pre-checking signatures and any other areas of the petition until the petitions are filed with the Board of Elections. Roll call:

Chairman Cloud	yea
Member penska	yea
Member Hall	no
Member Wunnenberg	no

The motion resulted in a tie vote.

Chairman Cloud explained to the members of the public how a tie vote works. He said each side would submit a letter to the Ohio Secretary of State with the reasoning of the vote and that the Secretary of State would break the tie vote.

Under General Office Updates, Director Unzicker presented a traffic flow map. Director Unzicker stated Deputy Director Corbin and herself are working with the Butler County Administrator, Bayer Becker, and the County Maintenance department. There was a short discussion regarding the proposed updates to the parking lot for better traffic flow and voter safety concerns.

Deputy Director Corbin stated Director Unzicker and himself have been reviewing Advisory 2023-03 Acquiring Electronic Pollbooks State Funding to start working with the County Commissioners. He explained if the board decides to use the same vendor, the intention is to implement the electronic poll books for the March 19, 2024, Primary Election. However, if the board chooses a new vendor, the electronic poll books will be implemented after the 2024 presidential election.

Deputy Director Corbin stated the Ohio Association of Election Officials Winter Conference will be from Wednesday, January 10, 2024, to Friday, January 12, 2024. He noted the rooms are reserved for each board member on Wednesday and Thursday nights.

Chairman Cloud allowed the Members of the Public to speak. Ms. Gerry Dzikowski stated she was concerned about the August 8, 2023, Special Election ballot language. She explained how she was confused when she received the message "verify your vote." She stated she had not voted yet when she saw the message. Ms. Dzikowski felt like votes were not being cast and that the length of the ballot could have been the problem. Deputy Director Corbin stated that the

problem arose in early voting and administration was notified there were reports of voter confusion on locating and selecting an option for the single issue. Once the problem was noticed, the Board of Elections staff instructed the voters to scroll down on the voting unit to select the “yes” or “no” options. Ms. Dzikowski states she was not instructed at the polling location. Deputy Director Corbin stated the issue was discussed during Location Supervisor training and a message was sent to all Location Supervisors on Election Day. Director Unzicker explained the voting unit gives an alert if a race or issue is not voted on to make the voter aware of their undervote. The alert allows the voter to go back and vote for the race or issue if they choose to do so.

Chairman Cloud gave Ms. Gale Neiderlehner the opportunity to speak. Ms. Neiderlehner presented a document to board members. Ms. Neiderlehner expressed her concerns about the use of the Dominion Voting System in Butler County. She explained she had researched the voting machines. Ms. Neiderlehner is concerned the QR code on the ICX paper is not recording the correct votes. Director Unzicker explained that post-election audit procedures are to hand-count each race or issue from the paper, not to scan the QR code. She said the board would be able to identify if there was a difference between the official results and the post-election audit results.

Member Hall made a motion to go into recess; seconded by Member penska. All in favor.

Chairman Cloud stated the board is back in session.

Ms. Neiderlehner continued to read her document. She also read highlights from various websites. Member Wunnenberg asked if she had viewed the QR code against the Voter Verified Paper Audit Trail tapes. Ms. Neiderlehner stated she would be interested in coming in to review the Voter Verified Paper Audit Trail tapes. Deputy Director Corbin said he is aware that Ms. Neiderlehner previously requested to inspect the Voter Verified Paper Audit Trail tapes and those were made available for inspection last September. He explained that inspection was the method of delivery for the Voter Verified Paper Audit Trail tapes because it is not feasible to make copies of the tapes. Director Unzicker stated the Voter Verified Paper Audit Trail tapes were made available per Ms. Neiderlehner’s request, but she never came in. Ms. Neiderlehner said she was unable to come due to other commitments.

With no further business, Member penska moved to adjourn the meeting; seconded by Member Wunnenberg. Roll call:

Chairman Cloud	yea
Member penska	yea
Member Hall	yea
Member Wunnenberg	yea

All in favor; motion carried.

The meeting was adjourned at approximately 10:47 a.m.

Frank Cloud, Chairman

Nicole Unzicker, Director

Todd Hall, Member

Chris Wunnenberg III, Member

mariann penska, Member